English Language Arts 10-2

Unit 2: Comprehend and respond to texts

Evidence and character

Action and motive in conflict

- Criteria for this retelling: events in the scene's order, a conflict with two pulls, and a motive you can point to.
- The scene: Priya is closing the rink snack bar when its metal shutter sticks halfway down with the cash tray inside, and the side door locks at 9:15. She crawls under because a yank might snap the shutter, and she still gets the tray out before 9:15.
- A rewrite says she smashes the shutter with the stick and the tray tumbles into the lot. It is more dramatic and it contradicts the crawl.
- Plausibility of the original holds: a stuck metal shutter, a stick used as a gap, five minutes, a door that locks. The lot-tumble adds a crash the setting left unprepared.

Two versions of the shutter

Scene
Priya crawls under the stuck shutter so the cash comes out and the metal stays still.

Rewrite
Priya smashes the shutter with the hockey stick and the tray flies into the lot.

Break
The smash cancels the motive the crawl was built to show.

Criteria and consistent character

- The criteria are the three things on the board you judge by.
- Evidence is the crawl and the refusal, quoted from the scene, used to support or contradict a reading.
- Plausibility asks whether this snack bar could contain the event. A stick under a gap can. An explosion needs a setup this scene leaves out.
- Consistency asks whether Priya's caution survives the new action. A smash needs a new motive or it breaks her.

Key terms

criteria

The specific things you check when you judge a piece of writing, such as events in order, a clear conflict, and a motive you can point to.

consistency

Whether a person keeps acting from the same motives, or breaks them without a reason.

plausibility

Whether the events and the place could hold together in the world the text created.

A made-up scene can still be believable

- The snack bar is invented and still plausible: shutters stick, doors lock, people protect cash.
- The smash is possible in some worlds. In this one it fights the reason we were given for the crawl.
- If a later sentence showed the shutter falling on her hand, a hard hit might become consistent. This rewrite leaves that sentence out.
- An interpretation that she wanted attention is contradicted by the quiet crawl. That is evidence work.

Applying the criteria

- Order: the rewrite skips the crawl and jumps to a crash. Criterion missed.
- Conflict: shutter versus lock can remain, so that criterion may still hold.
- Motive: protecting the metal is contradicted. Evidence is the original crawl.
- Plausibility: a tray flying into the lot needs much more force than a stick under a gap could ever give.

The bus that waits an hour

- Scene: Sam’s cable lock jams in the school bike cage, and the late bus is at the curb with doors open. He threads the cable through a neighbour’s rack, tapes a note to his seat explaining the jam, and boards.
- Rewrite: the bus driver waits an hour while Sam walks home for a spare key, and the note tells him to forget the wait.
- Judge plausibility and consistency.

Review

- Cover the shutter and the bus.
- Scene: Nia must return a first-aid kit before the custodian drops the bar across the equipment-room door. She tips a stuck bin so the kit slides out before the bar drops.
- Rewrite: she leaves the kit and goes home, then the story says she stays with every kit.
- Say which criterion fails, and quote the contradiction.